New Straits Times, Business Times – Thursday, 16 November 2023

BUSINESS JUDGMENT RULE

SAFEGUARDING DECISION-MAKING

DEVANESAN EVANSON

THE business judgment rule is a legal doctrine that provides a framework for courts to defer to the decisions of corporate directors and officers, acknowledging their expertise and discretion in managing the affairs of a company.

This principle serves as a crucial component of corporate governance, offering protection to decision-makers from personal liability for well-intentioned but potentially unsuccessful business judgments.

The foundation of the business judgment rule

The business judgment rule has its origins in common law and has evolved through judicial decisions over time. It is now a widely accepted principle in corporate law and is codified in the Malaysian Companies Act 2016 (S214).

Key elements

To invoke the protection of the business judgment rule, directors must show that:

The decision is made for a proper purpose and in good faith. Directors and officers must act in good faith, meaning their decisions should be made honestly and with a genuine belief that they are in the best interests of the company. Good faith is a foundational requirement for the application of the business judgment rule;

They have no material personal interest in the subject matter. The director must have no conflicts of interest. The rule assumes that directors and officers are acting without conflicts of interest that might compromise their ability to make impartial decisions. This element underscores the importance of independence and loyalty to the best interests of the company;

The decision is based on information given and reasonably believed to be appropriate under the circumstances. There must be informed decision-making. The rule expects that decisions are made after a reasonable and informed process. Directors and officers are required to exercise a reasonable degree of diligence, considering available information and data pertinent to the decision at hand. This element emphasises the importance of a well-informed decision-making process;

They believe the decision is in the best interest of the company. There must be rational decision-making. While not requiring perfection, the business judgment rule expects that decisions are rational and within a range of reasonableness. Courts are generally reluctant to second-guess business decisions as long as they fall within this range and are not arbitrary or capricious.

"The court would not second guess the merits of a commercial or business judgment made by directors. The court would not interfere with business decisions as long as the directors acted bona fide. A director's business judgment will be assessed by the courts on the basis of whether it was a decision premised on logic, sense and a rational basis." — Tengku Datuk Ibrahim Petra Tengku Indra Petra v. Petra Perdana Bhd [2018] 2MLJ 177 (Federal Court).

Utility of the business judgment rule:

Encourages risk-taking and innovation: One of the primary utilities of the business judgment rule is that it encourages corporate leaders to take calculated risks and make innovative decisions.

Knowing they are protected from personal liability as long as they act in good faith, directors and officers are more likely to explore new strategies and ventures that could benefit the company in the long run.

Effective corporate governance: The business judgment rule promotes effective corporate governance by recognising the authority and discretion of corporate leaders. It acknowledges that these individuals are best positioned to make informed decisions, given their proximity to the day-to-day operations of the company

Attracts competent directors and officers: Legal protection offered by the business judgment rule attracts skilled and experienced individuals to serve as directors and officers. The assurance that their decisions will be shielded from personal liability encourages qualified professionals to take on leadership roles within corporations.

Preserves board independence: By offering a level of protection to directors and officers, the business judgment rule contributes to preserving board independence. It reinforces the principle that directors are not expected to be infallible or predict the future accurately but should act in good faith and with reasonable care.

Protects against hindsight bias: Hindsight bias, the tendency to judge past events more harshly with the benefit of hindsight, is mitigated by the business judgment rule. It emphasises that decisions should be evaluated based on the information available to decision-makers at the time of the decision, not with the benefit of hindsight.

Shareholder value: Ultimately, the business judgment rule is a mechanism designed to protect shareholder value. By providing directors and officers with a level of protection, the rule contributes to the overall health and stability of corporations, benefiting shareholders in the long term.

The business judgment rule is a vital legal doctrine that recognises the autonomy and discretion of corporate leaders in making decisions for the benefit of the company. Its utility lies in fostering an environment that encourages risk-taking, innovation, and effective corporate governance.

By offering a degree of protection to directors and officers, the business judgment rule attracts competent leadership, preserves board independence, and contributes to the long-term success and value of corporations.

While it is not a shield for fraudulent or self-interested actions, the business judgment rule strikes a balance between accountability and the need for corporate decision-makers to operate in a dynamic and often uncertain business landscape. It stands as a cornerstone of corporate law, facilitating the prudent and informed decision-making necessary for the continued growth and prosperity of corporations.

The writer is chief executive officer of Minority Shareholders Watch Group.